



# Appendix N Evaluation of Alternative Designs & Preferred Design



# N.1 Evaluation of Alternate Design Concepts

# Evaluation of Alternative Design Concepts – October 2022 – Highway 401 to Steeles Avenue

|                                | Evaluation Criteria                                  | Alternative 1: Widen about the Centre Line                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Alternative 2: Widen to the East                                                                                                              | Alternative 3: Widen about the West                                                                                                                                         |  |
|--------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| Transportation<br>Planning     | Meet Official Plan Objectives                        | <ul> <li>Preferred alignment will be designed to meet desired design criteria</li> <li>Existing deficiencies along corridor will be addressed</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|                                | Improves Mode Choice                                 | Maintains current transit along segment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | n (ped/cycling connectivity) – sidewalks and MUP                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|                                |                                                      | No potential impact to existing bus stops                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | No potential impact to existing bus stops                                                                                                     | Requires relocation of newly constructed Zum bus stop on west side                                                                                                          |  |
|                                | Improves Congestion and Delays                       | <ul> <li>Improves congestion and delays by increasing capacity</li> <li>Congestion mitigation provided by active transportation improvements</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|                                | Improve Safety                                       | <ul> <li>Improves safety through provision of additional vehicular, and active transportation facilities</li> <li>Reduced collision potential with reduction in traffic congestion</li> <li>High potential for improved cyclists and pedestrian safety due to active transportation improvements. Provision of separated active transportation facilities will reduce conflicts with motorists</li> </ul>                                                            |                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|                                | Summary of Transportation                            | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                              |  |
| Engineering                    | Accommodates SWM and Drainage needs                  | <ul> <li>Requires realignment of ditch connecting to<br/>existing Hwy 407 ditch</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | <ul> <li>Requires realignment of ditch connecting to<br/>existing Hwy 407 ditch</li> </ul>                                                    | Minimal changes anticipated                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|                                | Minimizes utility relocations                        | <ul> <li>Potential to impact street lighting on both side<br/>of roadway and cell-tower located just north of<br/>Highway 401</li> <li>Potential impact to cellular communications<br/>tower between E-N/S ramp and Meadowpine<br/>Blvd</li> <li>Potential impact to TransCanada Pipeline</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                 | <ul> <li>of sides of roadway and cell-tower located just north of Highway 401</li> <li>Potential impact to cellular communications</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Potential to impact street lighting on both sides of roadway</li> <li>Potential impact to TransCanada Pipeline</li> </ul>                                          |  |
|                                | Minimizes Constructability Complexity                | <ul> <li>Requires reconstruction of Hwy 407 structure<br/>accommodate widening to the west</li> <li>Requires reconfiguration of Highway 401 S-<br/>Westbound ramp and W-N/S ramp</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | <ul> <li>Requires reconfiguration of Highway 401 S-<br/>Westbound ramp and W-N/S ramp</li> </ul>                                              | <ul> <li>Requires reconstruction of Hwy 407<br/>structure to accommodate widening to the<br/>west</li> <li>Potential to impact Highway 401 S-<br/>Westbound ramp</li> </ul> |  |
|                                | Minimizes Disruption due to Construction             | Construction can be accommodated in phases                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 5                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|                                | Summary of Engineering                               | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                   |  |
| Social-Cultural<br>Environment | Minimizes Impacts to Air Quality / Climate<br>Change | <ul> <li>Moderate improvement in air quality through reduced congestion</li> <li>Active transportation connectivity can reduce dependence on single occupant vehicle and provide air quality improvements</li> <li>Less reliance on single occupant vehicle can minimize effects on climate change</li> <li>Opportunity to implement trees and Low Impact Development strategies as part of roadway improvements can improve resiliency to climate change</li> </ul> |                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|                                | Minimizes Traffic Noise                              | <ul> <li>No noise sensitive receivers within segment</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|                                | Minimize impact on property                          | Potential to accommodate planned growth,<br>however minor shifts in alignment to avoid<br>constraints on east and west sides                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Reduced ability to accommodate planned growth, given identified utility constraints                                                           | <ul> <li>Impacts business' access on west side, just<br/>north of Highway 407</li> </ul>                                                                                    |  |
|                                | Minimizes impact on access                           | <ul> <li>Minimizes impact to businesses on west, as<br/>located back from roadway</li> <li>Encroaches businesses on east side</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Encroaches businesses on east side, as located in close proximity to roadway                                                                  | <ul> <li>Minimal impact to businesses on west side,<br/>as located back from the roadway<br/>Encroaches businesses on east side</li> </ul>                                  |  |
|                                | Summary of Social & Cultural Heritage                | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                     | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                   |  |

| • | Requires relocation of newly constructed |
|---|------------------------------------------|
|   | Zum bus stop on west side                |
|   | Zuill bus stop off west side             |

|                                    | Evaluation Criteria                                                 | Alternative 1: Widen about the Centre Line                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Alternative 2: Widen to the East                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Alternative 3: Widen about the West                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |
|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| Natural<br>Environment             | Protect vegetation, wildlife and aquatic habitat                    | No natural heritage features within this segment                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | ·                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |  |
|                                    | Summary of Natural Environment                                      | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
| Economic and Cost<br>Effectiveness | Construction Value                                                  | <ul> <li>High - requires reconstruction of entire Hwy<br/>407 structure to accommodate widening,<br/>costing millions</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                | <ul> <li>Medium – requires extension of Hwy 407<br/>structure to accommodate widening</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | <ul> <li>High - requires reconstruction of entire<br/>Hwy 407 structure to accommodate<br/>widening, costing millions</li> </ul>                                                                                                           |  |
|                                    | Accommodate Existing / Planned Development<br>and Growth / Land Use | <ul> <li>Reduced ability to accommodate planned growth, given identified hard constraints along corridor</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |
|                                    | Minimize Property Requirements                                      | <ul> <li>Property required on west side to support Zum<br/>Station</li> <li>Property required on east side between<br/>401/Meadowvale Blvd</li> </ul>                                                                                                           | <ul> <li>Property required on east side between<br/>401/Meadowvale Blvd</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | <ul> <li>Property required on west side to support<br/>Zum Station</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                              |  |
|                                    | Summary of Economic & Costs                                         | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
|                                    | OVERALL                                                             | This Alternative achieves the transportation and social-<br>cultural objectives of the Project, but results in<br>significant costs to accommodate the reconstruction of<br>the Hwy 407 structure, as well as impacts access to<br>businesses on the west side. | This Alternative achieves the transportation, socio-<br>cultural, and economic/cost objectives of the Project.<br>Constraints from this alignment include the<br>requirement to extend the Hwy 407 structure to the<br>east to accommodate the widened roadway<br>platform. In addition, there is the potential to<br>require stormwater management adjustments and<br>minimize grading to reduce impact on businesses on<br>the east side. | This Alternative achieves the transportation<br>objectives of the Project, but results in significant<br>costs to accommodate the reconstruction of the<br>Hwy 407 structure, as well as impacts access to<br>businesses on the west side. |  |
|                                    |                                                                     | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |

# Evaluation of Alternative Design Concepts – October 2022 – Steeles Avenue to 2km south of Embleton Road

|                                | Evaluation Criteria                                  | Alternative 1: Widen About the Centreline                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Alternative 2: Widen to the East                                                                                                                                               | Alternative 3: Widen to the West                                                                                                                                               |  |
|--------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| Transportation                 | Meet Official Plan Objectives                        | <ul> <li>Preferred alignment will be designed to meet desired design criteria</li> <li>Existing deficiencies along corridor will be addressed</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|                                | Improves Mode Choice                                 | <ul> <li>Provides opportunity for active transportation (ped/cycling connectivity)</li> <li>Opportunity to extend transit northward along Winston Churchill Boulevard</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|                                | Improves Congestion and Delays                       | <ul> <li>Improves congestion and delays by increasing capacity</li> <li>Congestion mitigation provided by active transportation improvements</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|                                | Improves Safety                                      | <ul> <li>Improves safety through provision of additional vehicular, and active transportation facilities</li> <li>Reduced collision potential with reduction in traffic congestion</li> <li>High potential for improved cyclists and pedestrian safety due to active transportation improvements. Provision of separated active transportation facilities will reduce conflicts with motorists</li> </ul>                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|                                | Summary of Transportation                            | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                 | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
| Engineering                    | Accommodates SWM and Drainage needs                  | <ul> <li>Requires new stormsewer installation<br/>northward to accommodate expanded roadway</li> <li>Opportunity to introduce LIDs to address water<br/>quality</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | <ul> <li>Requires new stormsewer installation<br/>northward to accommodate expanded<br/>roadway</li> <li>Opportunity to introduce LIDs to address<br/>water quality</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Requires new stormsewer installation<br/>northward to accommodate expanded<br/>roadway</li> <li>Opportunity to introduce LIDs to address<br/>water quality</li> </ul> |  |
|                                | Minimizes utility relocations / streetlights         | <ul> <li>Potential to impact street lighting on both sides<br/>of roadway</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Potential to impact street lighting on east side     of roadway                                                                                                                | <ul> <li>Potential to impact street lighting on west<br/>side of roadway</li> </ul>                                                                                            |  |
|                                | Minimizes Constructability Complexity                | <ul> <li>Requires extension of Mullet Creek culvert</li> <li>Minimal constructability issues</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|                                | Minimizes Disruption due to Construction             | Construction can be accommodated in phases                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|                                | Summary of Engineering                               | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                      | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                      |  |
| Social-Cultural<br>Environment | Minimizes Impacts to Air Quality / Climate<br>Change | <ul> <li>Moderate improvement in air quality through reduced congestion</li> <li>Active transportation connectivity can reduce dependence on single occupant vehicle and provide air quality improvements</li> <li>Less reliance on single occupant vehicle can minimize effects on climate change</li> <li>Opportunity to implement trees and Low Impact Development strategies as part of roadway improvements can improve resiliency to climate change</li> </ul> |                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|                                | Minimizes Traffic Noise                              | <ul> <li>Noise levels anticipated to increase with future traffic growth and lanes in closer proximity to residential properties on the west side</li> <li>Where warranted, noise mitigation to be implemented</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|                                | Minimizes Impact on Property                         | <ul> <li>Impact to residential properties on the west side</li> <li>Results in moderate impact to the Maple Lodge<br/>Farms parking and building located on the east<br/>side</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | <ul> <li>Significant impact to the Maple Lodge Farms<br/>parking and buildings located on the east side</li> </ul>                                                             | Significant impact to residential properties     on the west side                                                                                                              |  |
|                                | Improves Impacts on Access                           | Impacts access residential properties on the west, and Maple Lodge Farms on the east                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | <ul> <li>Significant changes to access Maple Lodge<br/>Farms</li> </ul>                                                                                                        | Significant modifications to access     residential properties                                                                                                                 |  |
|                                | Minimizes Impacts to Archaeological<br>Features      | Significant impact to the Mount Zion cemetery     on the east side                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Significant impact to the Mount Zion cemetery<br>located on the east side                                                                                                      | Moderate archaeological potential on the west side                                                                                                                             |  |
|                                | Minimizes Impacts to Cultural Heritage<br>Resources  | • Significant impact to cultural heritage resources associated with the cemetery                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | <ul> <li>Results in significant impact to cultural<br/>heritage resources associated with the<br/>cemetery</li> </ul>                                                          | No cultural heritage features impacted on the west side                                                                                                                        |  |
|                                | Summary of Social & Cultural Heritage                | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | NOT PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                  | NOT PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
|                                | Summary of Social & Cultural Hemage                  | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | NOT PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                  | INOT PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                 |  |

|                                    | Evaluation Criteria                                                 | Alternative 1: Widen About the Centreline                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Alternative 2: Widen to the East                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Alternative 3: Widen to the West                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                    | Protects Vegetation, Wildlife and Aquatic<br>Habitat                | <ul> <li>Potential to impact mineral meadow marsh and<br/>fresh-moist marsh</li> <li>Potential to impact fish and fish habitat<br/>associated with Mullet Creek</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                | <ul> <li>Potential to impact Fresh-Moist Lowland<br/>Deciduous Forest on east side</li> <li>Potential to impact fish and fish habitat<br/>associated with Mullet Creek</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                     | <ul> <li>Potential to impact mineral meadow marsh<br/>and fresh-moist marsh</li> <li>Potential to impact fish and fish habitat<br/>associated with Mullet Creek</li> </ul>                                                          |
|                                    | Summary of Natural Environment                                      | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Economic and Cost<br>Effectiveness | Construction Value                                                  | <ul> <li>Less costs associated with rehabilitating existing<br/>roadway, with some additional extensions on<br/>both sides. Culvert extension on both sides<br/>increases construction costs.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                  | <ul> <li>Requires reconstruction of full segment of<br/>roadway on east side</li> <li>Culvert extension on one side leads to<br/>moderate construction costs</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                               | <ul> <li>Requires reconstruction of full segment of<br/>roadway on west side</li> <li>Culvert extension on one side leads to<br/>moderate construction costs</li> </ul>                                                             |
|                                    | Accommodate Existing / Planned<br>Development and Growth / Land Use | <ul> <li>Reduced ability to accommodate planned<br/>growth, given identified hard constraints along<br/>corridor</li> <li>Minimal impact to businesses on west side and<br/>east sides</li> <li>Impacts Maple Lodge Farms parking lot, as well<br/>as chicken facility on east side</li> </ul>                                                            | <ul> <li>Reduced ability to accommodate planned<br/>growth, given identified hard constraints along<br/>corridor</li> <li>Encroaches parking on east side, north of<br/>Highway 407</li> <li>Impacts Maple Lodge Farms parking lot, as<br/>well as chicken facility on east side</li> </ul>                                                                                           | <ul> <li>Reduced ability to accommodate planned<br/>growth, given identified hard constraints<br/>along corridor</li> <li>Minimizes impact to businesses on west side</li> <li>No businesses on west side to be impacted</li> </ul> |
|                                    | Minimize Property Requirements                                      | Moderate residential properties impacted on     both sides of the roadway                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Moderate residential and commercial     property required on east side                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | <ul> <li>Significant residential property required;<br/>including full buy-outs</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                          |
|                                    | Summary of Economic and Costs                                       | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|                                    |                                                                     | This Alternative achieves the transportation, however<br>has the potential for significant impacts to cultural<br>heritage resources on the east side, as well as the<br>Chicken Shoppe. There is a moderate cost associated<br>with the number of properties that would be impacted.                                                                     | This alternative is not preferred as a result of the<br>significant impact to Mount Zion Cemetery on the<br>east side, and the cultural heritage resources<br>associated with it. It also has significant impacts on<br>the access to Maple Lodge Farms, as well as impacts<br>on parking and the building. The alternative results in<br>significant impact on property acquisition. | This alternative has a significant impact on the<br>residential properties on the west side, including<br>several full buy-outs. This alternative would<br>require reconstruction of a full segment of the<br>roadway.              |
|                                    | OVERALL                                                             | MOST PREFERRED<br>*It should be noted that this alternative was revisited<br>following the Stage 2 AA for the Mount Zion Cemetery.<br>Given the constraints within this segment, the Project<br>Team mitigated the cross-section for a better fit,<br>resulting in less property impacts to both residential<br>and cultural resources along the corridor | NOT PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | NOT PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |

# Evaluation of Alternative Design Concepts – October 2022 – 2km south of Embleton Road to Embleton Road

|                                | Evaluation Criteria                                                                                        | Alternative 1: Widen about the Centreline                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Alternative 2: Widen to the East                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Alternative 3: Widen to the West                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |  |
|--------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| Transportation<br>Planning     | Meet Official Plan Objectives<br>Improves Mode Choice<br>Improves Congestion and Delays<br>Improves Safety | <ul> <li>Preferred alignment will be designed to meet desired design criteria</li> <li>Existing deficiencies along corridor will be addressed</li> <li>Provides opportunity for active transportation (ped/cycling connectivity)</li> <li>Opportunity to extend transit northward along Winston Churchill Blvd</li> <li>Improves congestion and delays by increasing capacity</li> <li>Congestion mitigation provided by active transportation improvements</li> <li>Improves safety through provision of additional vehicular, and active transportation facilities</li> </ul> |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |  |
|                                |                                                                                                            | <ul> <li>Reduced collision potential with reduction in traffic congestion</li> <li>High potential for improved cyclists and pedestrian safety due to active transportation improvements. Provision of separated active transportation facilities will reduce conflicts with motorists</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |  |
|                                | Summary of Transportation                                                                                  | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |
| Engineering                    | Accommodates SWM and Drainage Needs                                                                        | <ul> <li>Requires construction of stormsewers<br/>northward to accommodate expanded<br/>roadway</li> <li>Requires realignment of Culvert 7, located near<br/>future Financial Drive</li> <li>Requires realignment of Levi Creek North<br/>Branch to accommodate widened roadway and<br/>culvert extension</li> <li>Opportunity to introduce LIDs to address water<br/>quality</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                        | <ul> <li>Requires construction of stormsewers<br/>northward to accommodate expanded<br/>roadway</li> <li>Requires realignment of Culvert 7, located near<br/>future Financial Drive</li> <li>Opportunity to introduce LIDs to address water<br/>quality</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Requires construction of stormsewers<br/>northward to accommodate expanded<br/>roadway</li> <li>Requires realignment of Levi Creek North<br/>Branch to accommodate widened roadway<br/>and culvert extension</li> <li>Opportunity to introduce LIDs to address<br/>water quality</li> </ul> |  |
|                                | Minimizes Utility Relocations                                                                              | <ul> <li>Requires relocation of existing utility poles on<br/>both sides</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | <ul> <li>Requires relocation of existing utility poles on<br/>east side</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                 | Requires relocation of existing utility poles     on west side                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |
|                                | Minimizes Constructability Complexity                                                                      | <ul> <li>Three-stages of construction</li> <li>Requires realignment of Levi Creek North<br/>Branch</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | <ul> <li>Two-stages of construction</li> <li>No realignment of Levi Creek required</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                      | <ul> <li>Two-stages of construction</li> <li>Requires realignment of Levi Creek North<br/>Branch</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                          |  |
|                                | Minimizes Disruption Due to Construction                                                                   | Construction can be accommodated in phases                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | ·                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |  |
|                                | Summary of Engineering                                                                                     | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |
| Social-Cultural<br>Environment | Minimizes Impacts to Air Quality / Climate<br>Change                                                       | <ul> <li>Moderate improvement in air quality through reduced congestion</li> <li>Active transportation connectivity can reduce dependence on single occupant vehicle and provide air quality improvements</li> <li>Less reliance on single occupant vehicle can minimize effects on climate change</li> <li>Opportunity to implement tree plants in and Low Impact Development strategies as part of roadway improvements can improve resiliency to climate change</li> </ul>                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |  |
|                                | Minimizes Traffic Noise                                                                                    | Noise levels anticipated to increase with future traffic growth and lanes in closer proximity to properties                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Noise levels anticipated to increase with future traffic growth and lanes in closer proximity to properties                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |  |
|                                | Minimizes Impact on Property                                                                               | <ul> <li>Reduced impact to residential properties</li> <li>No businesses located north of Maple Lodge<br/>Farms</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | <ul> <li>Significant impact to residential houses near roadway</li> <li>No businesses located north of Maple Lodge Farms</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                | <ul> <li>Significant impact to residential properties</li> <li>No businesses located north of Maple Lodge<br/>Farms</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                       |  |
|                                | Minimizes Impact on Access<br>Minimizes Impacts to Archaeological<br>Resources                             | <ul> <li>Opportunity to improve access, via TWLTL</li> <li>Archaeological potential requiring Stage 2 on<br/>both sides of roadway</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | <ul> <li>Opportunity to improve access, via TWLTL</li> <li>Archaeological potential requiring Stage 2 on<br/>both sides of roadway</li> </ul>                                                                                                                      | <ul> <li>Opportunity to improve access, via TWLTL</li> <li>Archaeological potential requiring Stage 2<br/>on both sides of roadway</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                        |  |

|                                    | Evaluation Criteria                                                 | Alternative 1: Widen about the Centreline                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Alternative 2: Widen to the East                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Alternative 3: Widen to the West                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                    | Minimizes Impacts to Cultural Heritage<br>Resources                 | Moderate impact to cultural heritage resource     on west side                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | No impact to cultural heritage resources                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | <ul> <li>Significant impact to cultural heritage<br/>resource on west side</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|                                    | Summary of Social & Cultural Heritage                               | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Natural Environment                | Avoids Vegetation                                                   | <ul> <li>Impacts dry-moist old meadow and mineral<br/>cultural thicket</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | <ul> <li>Impacts dry-moist old meadow and mineral<br/>cultural thicket</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | No impact                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|                                    | Minimizes impact to wildlife                                        | <ul> <li>Minimal impact to wildlife</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Minimal impact to wildlife                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Moderate impact to wildlife                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|                                    | Minimizes Aquatic Habitat                                           | <ul> <li>Requires realignment of Levi Creek North</li> <li>Potential to impact Redside Dace habitat<br/>associated with Levi Creek South and North</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | <ul> <li>Potential to impact Redside Dace habitat<br/>associated with Levi Creek South and North</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | <ul> <li>Requires realignment of Levi Creek North</li> <li>Potential to impact Redside Dace habitat<br/>associated with Levi Creek South and North</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                  |
|                                    | Summary of Natural Environment                                      | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Economic and Cost<br>Effectiveness | Construction Value                                                  | <ul> <li>Less costs associated with rehabilitating<br/>existing roadway, with some additional<br/>extensions on both sides. Culvert extension on<br/>both sides increases construction costs.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | <ul> <li>Requires reconstruction of full segment of<br/>roadway on east side</li> <li>Culvert extension on one side leads to<br/>moderate construction costs</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | <ul> <li>Requires reconstruction of full segment of<br/>roadway on west side</li> <li>Culvert extension on one side leads to<br/>moderate construction costs</li> </ul>                                                                                                                        |
|                                    | Accommodate Existing / Planned<br>Development and Growth / Land Use | Ability to accommodate planned growth in the f                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|                                    | Minimize Property Requirements                                      | No businesses located north of Maple Lodge Farms                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|                                    | Summary of Economic and Cost<br>Effectiveness                       | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|                                    |                                                                     | This Alternative was preferred for transportation and<br>socio-economic. It has minimal impact on residential<br>properties as impacts are equal on both sides. It has<br>moderate impacts on cultural heritage resources on<br>the west side and minimal impacts to the PSW<br>associated with Levi Creek North and South. This<br>alternative also allows for an easier transition to a<br>two-lane roadway north of Embleton Road. | This alternative does not facilitate a transition to a<br>narrowed cross-section north of Embleton Road. This<br>alternative impacts one cultural heritage resource,<br>wetlands associated with Levi Creek North and South<br>and potential impact to fish and fish habitat located at<br>Levi Creek North. It also results in significant impacts<br>to residential houses located near the roadway. | This alternative does not facilitate a transition to a<br>narrowed cross-section north of Embleton Road.<br>This alternative results in minimal impacts to<br>wetlands associated with Levi Creek North and<br>South. It also has the potential to impact five<br>cultural heritage resources. |
|                                    | OVERALL                                                             | MOST PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | NOT PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | NOT PREFERRED                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |