Criteria \ Alternatives	Do Nothing	Reduced Lane Widths with Multi-Use Path on West Side and Paved Shoulder and Rumble Strip on East Side	Reduced Lane Widths with Multi-Use Path on West Side and New Sidewalk and Buffered Bike Lane on East Side
Transportation			
Improves traffic operations	• No change to traffic operations	• Acceptable traffic operations	• Acceptable traffic operations
Improves traffic safety	• No change to traffic safety	• Reduced lane widths to encourage slower traffic speeds	• Reduced lane widths to encourage slower traffic speeds
Encourages some trucks to use other truck routes	• No change to truck traffic	• Slower traffic speeds may encourage truck diversion	• Slower traffic speeds may encourage truck diversion
Improves road geometrics	• No change to road alignment	• No change to road alignment	• No change to road alignment
Conforms to transportation planning policies and plans	• Not consistent with transportation planning policies and plans	• Generally consistent with transportation planning policies and plans	• Generally consistent with transportation planning policies and plans
Maintains emergency response time	• No change to emergency response time	• Two-way roads with raised centre median provide less sufficient space for emergency vehicles	• Two-way roads without raised centre median provide sufficient space for emergency vehicles
		• Design will accommodate emergency vehicles	• Design will accommodate emergency vehicles
Natural Environment			
Complies with Provincial environmental planning policies	• Located within Oak Ridges Moraine	• Consistent with policy 18.1a of the Oak Ridges Moraine Plan by providing active transportation facilities which contribute to a range of transportation options	• Consistent with policy 18.1a of the Oak Ridges Moraine Plan by providing active transportation facilities which contribute to a range of transportation options
	• Located within Greenbelt Plan Area; Caledon East is a Settlement Area under the Greenbelt Plan	• Consistent with the Greenbelt Plan	• Consistent with the Greenbelt Plan
Avoids or reduces negative impacts on natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat	• No change to natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat	• Encroaches into minimum protection zones and rare vegetation community; Potential indirect impacts to Butternut Tree	• Encroaches into minimum protection zones and rare vegetation community; Potential indirect impacts to Butternut Tree
		• Moderate tree removal	• Minor tree removal
		• Moderate to minor extensions to culverts	• Moderate extensions to culverts
		• No impacts anticipated to species at risk and their habitat	• No impacts anticipated to species at risk and their habitat
Introduces opportunity to protect or enhance natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat	• No opportunity to enhance natural heritage features and wildlife and wildlife habitat	• Partially urbanizing corridor may increase potential for vehicle-wildlife conflicts	• Urbanizing corridor may increase potential for vehicle-wildlife conflicts
Maintains or reduces risk for natural hazards	• No opportunity to reduce risk for natural hazards	• Increased impervious area contributing to stormwater runoff	• Increased impervious area contributing to stormwater runoff
		• May require stormwater management on west side to treat runoff; No change to treatment (existing ditch) on east side for stormwater runoff	• May require stormwater management to treat stormwater runoff
		• Sediment and erosion control plan will be applied during construction	• Sediment and erosion control plan will be applied during construction
Protects sources of drinking water	• Majority of corridor is within Highly Vulnerable Aquifer Area • Sections of corridor are within Significant Groundwater Recharge Areas	• Majority of corridor is within Highly Vulnerable Aquifer Area • Sections of corridor are within Significant Groundwater Recharge Areas	• Majority of corridor is within Highly Vulnerable Aquifer Area • Sections of corridor are within Significant Groundwater Recharge Areas
Provides opportunity to adapt to or mitigate the effects of climate change	• No opportunity to adapt to or mitigate the effects of climate change	• Potential for low impact development	• Potential for low impact development
		• No significant impact on greenhouse gas emissions anticipated	• No significant impact on greenhouse gas emissions anticipated
Healthy Communities			
Provides for active transportation	• No active transportation facilities	• Multi-use path on west side for cyclists and pedestrians and paved shoulder on east side for cyclists going northbound	• Multi-use path on west side and paved shoulder and buffered bike lane on east side to accommodate pedestrians and cyclists
		• Continues to provide walkway between Walker Road and Leamster Trail	• Provides sidewalk on east side between Walker Road and Leamster Trail, however nearest crossing is at Walker Road
		• Compatible with design guidelines for roads with design speed greater than 50 km/h or designated for trucks	• Compatible with design guidelines for roads with design speed greater than 50 km/h or designated for trucks
Reduces risk of chronic conditions through active transportation	• No opportunity to promote healthy (active) environments	• Non-continuous pedestrian and cycling facilities between rural and urban areas	• Continuity of paved buffered bike lane to paved shoulder on east side for cyclists entering rural area
		• Separation between pedestrians and cyclists	• No separation between pedestrians and cyclists
		• Wide separation between pedestrians and roadway on west side; Rumble strips deter vehicles from crossing over to shoulder on east side	• Wide separation between pedestrians and roadway on west side; Buffer (separation) between cyclists and travel lane on east side
		• Paved shoulders improve surface accessibility compared to granular shoulders	• Paved buffered bike lanes improve surface accessibility compared to granular shoulders
		• Increased access to destinations within Study corridor by active means	• Increased access to destinations within Study corridor by active means
		• No reduction in design speed	No reduction in design speed

Accessible Environments

Criteria \ Alternatives	Do Nothing	Reduced Lane Widths with Multi-Use Path on West Side and Paved Shoulder and Rumble Strip on East Side	Reduced Lane Widths with Multi-Use Path on West Side and New Sidewalk and Buffered Bike Lane on East Side
Promotes Healthy, Age-Friendly and A		• Potential for tree planting on west side	• Potential for tree planting on both sides
Supports age friendly and accessible living	• No opportunity to support age friendly and accessible living	• Paved shoulders may not be comfortable for all cyclists	• Multi-use path may not be comfortable for all pedestrians and cyclists
Reduces risk of respiratory and cardiovascular outcomes associated with exposure to traffic related air pollution	• Avoids air quality impacts	• Air quality impacts are similar to air quality impacts of future no-build scenario	• Air quality impacts are similar to air quality impacts of future no-build scenario
		• Increased dust during construction will be controlled by an Emissions Management Plan	• Increased dust during construction will be controlled by an Emissions Management Plan
Avoids or reduces noise impacts	• Avoids noise impacts	• Future sound levels are predicted to exceed threshold (60 dba) in some areas of sensitive receptors	• Future sound levels are predicted to exceed threshold (60 dba) in some areas of sensitive receptors
		• Noise barriers will be implemented where warranted	• Noise barriers will be implemented where warranted
		• Changes to future sound levels are expected to be small between Caledon Trailway and south of Walker Road	• Changes to future sound levels are expected to be small between Caledon Trailway and south of Walker Road
		• Increased noise during construction will be controlled by Construction Code of Practice	• Increased noise during construction will be controlled by Construction Code of Practice
Social, Cultural and Economic Environment			
Conforms to Municipal planning policies and community plans	• Does not fully conform with Region of Peel and Town of Caledon Official Plans and Growth Management Policies	• Conforms with Region of Peel and Town of Caledon Official Plans and Growth Management Policies	• Conforms with Region of Peel and Town of Caledon Official Plans and Growth Management Policies
Compatible with existing and planned future land uses	• No impact to existing and planned future land uses	• Rural cross-sections are generally upgraded to urban within settlement areas	• Rural cross-sections are generally upgraded to urban within settlement areas
Avoids or reduces property impacts (including cultural heritage and local economic impacts)	• Avoids property impacts	• No impacts to property, buildings/structures and property access outside intersection improvements	• No impacts to property, buildings/structures and property access outside intersection improvements
	• Avoids negative impacts on cultural heritage features	• Adjacent to identified cultural heritage resources (one designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, one potential built heritage resource)	• Adjacent to identified cultural heritage resources (one designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, one potential built heritage resource)
		• Stage 2 Archaeological Assessment required in areas beyond disturbed right-of-way	• Stage 2 Archaeological Assessment required in areas beyond disturbed right-of-way
	• No opportunity to improve local economic sustainability	• No impact on customer access to businesses	• No impact on customer access to businesses
		• No impact on public and customer parking	• No impact on public and customer parking
		• Potential for raised centre median with gateway feature between Walker Road and Leamster Trail	• No potential for raised centre median with gateway feature between Walker Road and Leamster Trail
		• No grading impact on farm land/entrances	• No grading impact on farm land/entrances
		• Sufficient pavement width for farm vehicles and commercial trucks	• Sufficient pavement width for farm vehicles and commercial trucks
Supports goods movement	• Airport Road is a goods movement corridor	• Airport Road will remain as a goods movement corridor	• Airport Road will remain as a goods movement corridor
		• Design will accommodate transport trucks	• Design will accommodate transport trucks
Reduces complexity of construction	• No conflict with utility and municipal infrastructure	• Utility and municipal infrastructure to be relocated	• Utility and municipal infrastructure to be relocated; May require additional street lighting
	• No construction staging	• Minor temporary traffic impact due to construction staging	• Moderate temporary traffic impact due to staging of storm sewers
	• No construction cost	• Moderate cost to construct due to drainage	• High cost to construct due to drainage, street lighting and material
	• No change to operations and maintenance cost	• Moderate cost to operate and maintain	• High cost to operate and maintain
Evaluation			
	Not Carried Forward	**Preferred**	**Not Preferred**
Summary	Does not address problem and opportunity	Suitable for transition from urban to rural area by retaining existing path on west side for northbound pedestrians and cyclists and improving existing conditions on east side with paved shoulders for cyclists, resulting in less cost to construct and operate/maintain than alternative with multi-use path, sidewalk and bike lanes	Higher cost to construct and operate/maintain than alternative with pathway and paved shoulders