



**THE REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY OF PEEL**  
**COMMUNITY WATER FLUORIDATION COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES**

**CWFC - 3/2018**

The Region of Peel Community Water Fluoridation Committee met on September 27, 2018 at 1:35 p.m., in the Peel Conference Centre, 1st Floor, Regional Administrative Headquarters, Suite B, 10 Peel Centre Drive, Brampton, ON.

**Members Present:** J. Downey; M. Palleschi; J. Sprovieri

**Members Absent:** F. Dale, due to personal matters; J. Kovac, due to other municipal business

**Also Present:** D. Szwarc, Chief Administrative Officer; N. Polsinelli, Commissioner of Health Services; J. Hennings for J. Smith, Commissioner of Public Works; S. Dickson, Acting Regional Solicitor; Dr. J. Hopkins, Medical Officer of Health; K. Lockyer, Regional Clerk and Director of Clerk's; H. West, Committee Clerk; S. MacGregor, Legislative Assistant

*Chaired by Councillor Downey.*

**1. DECLARATIONS OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST – Nil**

**2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

RECOMMENDATION CWFC-8-2018:

That the agenda for the September 27, 2018 Community Water Fluoridation Committee (CWFC) meeting include an additional communication from Christine Massey regarding Comments to the Region of Peel Staff Report from the July 5, 2018 CWFC, to be dealt with under Communications - Item 5.6;

And further, that the agenda for the September 27, 2018 CWFC meeting be approved, as amended.

---

\* See text for arrivals

◆ See text for departures

**3. DELEGATIONS**

- 3.1. Liesa Cianchino, Chair, Concerned Residents of Peel to End Fluoridation,** Reading an Affidavit Prepared by John Remington-Graham, Counselor at Law, Regarding Judicial Findings in Three Landmark Cases in Pennsylvania, Illinois and Texas that Artificial Water Fluoridation Causes Cancer and Other Ailments in Man

Received

RECOMMENDATION CWFC-9-2018:

That the Regional Solicitor be directed to evaluate the affidavit from John Remington-Graham and the supporting documentation as listed on the September 27, 2018 CWFC agenda from a Canadian legal perspective;

And further, that staff report to the new term of Regional Council regarding the context of the US court rulings.

Liesa Cianchino, Chair, Concerned Residents of Peel to End Fluoridation, read an affidavit prepared by John Remington-Graham, Counselor at Law, regarding judicial findings in three landmark cases in Pennsylvania, Illinois and Texas. She stated that she would provide any questions that the Committee has to John Remington-Graham and that he will respond by way of affidavit.

Liesa Cianchino summarized legal opinions from other parties that previously appeared before the Committee since 2014 on behalf of Concerned Residents of Peel to End Fluoridation. She stated that the Concerned Residents were told that the CWFC was to provide a recommendation to Regional Council, believing that the recommendation would be to either keep in, or remove fluoride from the communal drinking water, however Regional Council chose to reduce the fluoride concentration and chemical compounds which still contains Hydrofluorosilicic Acid (HFSA). Liesa Cianchino stated that there have not been any toxicological studies to prove that fluoridated water is safe and effective noting that many communities have stopped adding fluoride to community water.

Councillor Sprovieri inquired as to what was the result of the court rulings in the three cases where the court found that water fluoridation does cause cancer. Liesa Cianchino requested that any questions related to the affidavit be provided to her in writing and she will forward them to Mr. John Remington-Graham for his response.

In response to a question from Councillor Sprovieri regarding whether the United States court rulings have any value to the Region of Peel, Steve Dickson, Acting Regional Solicitor, stated that staff would need to evaluate the affidavit and the three court rulings to determine if there is any relevance to the Region of Peel context.

**4. REPORTS**

**4.1. Community Water Fluoridation - Using Evidence to Inform Public Health Practice**

Presentation by Jessica Hopkins, Medical Officer of Health

RECOMMENDATION CWFC-10-2018:

That the report from the Commissioner of Health Services and Medical Officer of Health titled "Community Water Fluoridation – Using Evidence to Inform Public Health Practice" and the related presentation be referred to a CWFC meeting in the next term of Regional Council.

Councillor Sprovieri stated that the presentation is quite extensive, and due to time limitations he moved a motion to refer the report and presentation to the CWFC in the new term of Council.

Helena West, Committee Clerk, advised that the new term of Council will determine which Committees will continue for the 2018 – 2022 term at the December 13, 2018 Regional Council meeting and it cannot be confirmed at this time if the CWFC will be re-established.

**4.2. Community Water Fluoridation - Staff Response to Committee Selected Studies**

RECOMMENDATION CWFC-11-2018:

That the report from the Commissioner of Health Services and the Medical Officer of Health, titled "Community Water Fluoridation Staff Response to Committee Selected Studies", be referred to a CWFC meeting in the next term of Regional Council.

**4.3. Information Regarding Toxicology Reviews**

Presentation by Jessica Hopkins, Medical Officer of Health

Received

RECOMMENDATION CWFC-12-2018:

Whereas, Health Canada in its letter addressed to the Regional Chair dated April 4, 2012 recommends that toxicology reviews of the fluoridation product (Hydrofluorosilicic Acid (HFSA)) be done to ensure its safety at its maximum use level;

And whereas, Health Canada is on record that no toxicology studies have been done on HFSA, as outlined in their letter dated May 26, 2014, from

the Access to Information and Privacy Division, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor, Suite 700, Holland Cross, Tower B, 1600 Scott Street, Ottawa, Ontario, K1A 0K9;

Therefore be it resolved, that the Community Water Fluoridation Committee (CWFC) refers this motion to the new CWFC for the 2018-2022 term of Regional Council, to request that the CWFC consider that a moratorium be placed on water fluoridation in Peel Region until the toxicology reviews recommended by Health Canada have been completed to assure that drinking water fluoridated through the use of HFSA is safe for public consumption.

Jessica Hopkins, Medical Officer of Health, stated that her two presentations and report listed as Item 4.2 provides responses to the emails from Councillor Sprovieri listed as Communication Items 5.1 through 5.5 (inclusive).

In regard to Item 5.1, Jessica Hopkins stated that the communication deals mainly with two issues: who is responsible to do toxicological studies on fluoridation products; and, why are there no toxicological studies required for HFSA. She stated that the National Sanitation Foundation/American National Standards Institute (NSF/ANSI) has tested and certified three fluoride-containing water treatment additives: HFSA; Sodium Fluorosilicate; and, Sodium Fluoride. Health Canada sets the maximum acceptable concentration of fluoride in public drinking water supplies at 1.5 mg/L which is based on an extensive review of evidence, including toxicological evidence, and is considered protective against all potential adverse health effects.

In regard to Item 5.2, it was requested if there is a document similar to the US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Toxicological Review of Chlorine Dioxide and Chlorite for fluoride. Jessica Hopkins stated that the Guidelines for Canadian Drinking Water Quality, sets the maximum acceptable concentration of fluoride in public water supplies (1.5 mg/L.) and that Section 13 of the Guidelines provides a full list of references and studies used for the development of the Guideline, which is publicly available. Included in Section 13 is the Toxicological Profile for Fluorides, Hydrogen Fluoride, and Fluoride by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry, 2013. This document is similar in content to the EPA review of Chlorine Dioxide and Chlorite.

Jessica Hopkins stated that Items 5.3-5.5 regarding staff responses to various studies were responded to in Item 4.2 which has been referred to the next term of Council. She noted that fluoride is not classified as a neurotoxin by EPA.

Councillor Sprovieri made reference to the letter listed under Item 5.5 from Health Canada, Access to Information and Privacy Division, that states there were no results of a search of information regarding toxicological studies relating to HFSA. Jessica Hopkins reiterated that HFSA disassociates therefore no toxicological studies can be administered, noting that toxicological studies are done on fluoride.

Councillor Sprovieri stated there is conflicting information regarding disassociation of HSFA noting that there is a German study that states that HSFA disassociates when using distilled water or high-grade HSFA, however only 60 per cent of HSFA disassociates when placed in tap water. He inquired if Health Canada has determined that HSFA disassociates when placed in

tap water. Jessica Hopkins responded that she cannot speak on behalf of Health Canada, however, literature is available that states that HFSA disassociates.

Councillor Sprovieri stated that the past study that was presented to the Committee was based on distilled water and he asked how the Committee can be assured that fluoridated water is safe. Jessica Hopkins responded that the presentation listed as Item 4.1 provides a view on the work carried out by Public Health and that the presentation was prepared to assure Members of Council that staff are using due diligence when providing information to Council so that they are comfortable in making decisions.

Councillor Sprovieri stated that he is not satisfied with the information that HSFA disassociates and he made a recommendation, for Regional Council approval, that a moratorium be placed on communal water fluoridation in Peel Region until the Province of Ontario or Health Canada completes toxicology studies regarding HFSA.

Councillor Downey stated that she is of the understanding that drinking water is studied and tested before it is released to the public and requested the source/study that states that only 60 per cent of HSFA disassociates in tap water.

Councillor Palleschi stated the recommendation should be referred to the next CWFC instead of Regional Council, along with the two reports and presentation that were referred, which should be heard first. He noted that if the new term of Council continues with the CWFC, then the mandate of the Committee may need to be adjusted.

## **5. COMMUNICATIONS**

- 5.1. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, E-mail dated August 22, 2018, Forwarding on an E-mail from Gilles Parent Guidelines Regarding Canadian Drinking Water Quality: Guideline Technical Document – Fluoride and Toxicological Studies

Received

- 5.2. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, E-mail dated August 22, 2018, Providing a Copy of a Report From the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Regarding EPA Toxicological Review of Chlorine Dioxide and Chlorite

Received

- 5.3. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, E-mail dated August 22, 2018, Providing a Copy of the Lancet Neurology Review, March 12, 2014, Volume 13, Regarding Neurobehaviour Effects of Developmental Toxicity

Received

- 5.4. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, E-mail dated August 22, 2018, Providing a Copy of an Article From Environmental Perspectives, 2017, Regarding Prenatal Fluoride Exposure and Cognitive Outcomes in Children 4 and 6-12 Years of Age in Mexico

Received

- 5.5. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, E-mail dated August 28, 2018, Providing Various Fluoride Attachments

Received

**Additional Item**

- 5.6. Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, E-mail dated September 25, 2018, Providing Comments to the Region of Peel Staff Report from the July 5, 2018 Community Water Fluoridation Committee

Received

- 6. IN CAMERA MATTERS – Nil**

- 7. OTHER BUSINESS – Nil**

- 8. NEXT MEETING**

To be determined.

- 9. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 3:10 p.m.