



THE REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY OF PEEL
COMMUNITY WATER FLUORIDATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES

CWFC - 1/2018

The Region of Peel Community Water Fluoridation Committee met on April 19, 2018 at 9:12 a.m., in the Regional Council Chambers, 5th Floor, Regional Administrative Headquarters, 10 Peel Centre Drive, Suite A, Brampton, ON.

Members Present: F. Dale; J. Innis* (Designate for J. Downey); J. Kovac; M. Palleschi; J. Sprovieri

Members Absent: J. Downey, due to other municipal business

Also Present: D. Szwarc, Chief Administrative Officer; N. Polsinelli, Commissioner of Health Services; J. Smith, Commissioner of Public Works; P. O'Connor, Regional Solicitor; Dr. J. Hopkins, Medical Officer of Health; A. Macintyre, Acting Regional Clerk; H. West, Committee Clerk; S. MacGregor, Legislative Assistant

A quorum of voting members was not present, and in accordance with section 4.5.4 of the Region of Peel Procedure By-law 9-2018, the Community Water Fluoridation Committee (CWFC) received information.

Councillor Sprovieri was appointed as the Presiding Officer and noted that upon arrival of an additional member, quorum would be achieved and at that time the Committee would formally elect a Chair and Vice-Chair for the Committee.

Delegations – 4.3 was dealt with.

4. DELEGATIONS

4.3. Dr. Gilles Parent, Addressing the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care's Response to Regional Chair Dale's Letter Regarding Regional Water Fluoridation in Ontario

Received

Dr. Gilles Parent, introduced himself stating that he is a Naturopathic Doctor who has practiced in Quebec since 1973. He stated that less than 2 per cent of Quebec communities use fluoridated water.

* See text for arrivals

◆ See text for departures

Dr. Parent referred to the Ministry of Health and Long Term Care's response to the Region of Peel's letter and statements made regarding the Public Health Ontario's review of the National Sanitation Foundation/American National Standards Institute (NSF/ANSI) Standard 60: Drinking Water Treatment Chemicals – Health Effects. He raised concern, that in his opinion, the Ministry has not supplied a toxicological review to prove that hydrofluorosilicic acid (HFSA) is safe; that the Ministry implies that administering a water treatment chemical to prevent disease is ethical; that no health authority knows the exact effective and safe dose of fluoride; and, that dental fluorosis is on the rise.

Dr. Parent highlighted that the NSF document has a disclaimer that states "Provisions for safety have not been included in the Standard because governmental agencies or other national standards-setting organizations provide safety requirements" and he noted that no Canadian or American governmental agency has ever provided safety toxicology studies on HFSA, being one of three products that NSF certifies.

Dr. Parent reviewed the definitions of the *Food and Drug Act* and referenced the Supreme Court of Canada 1957 ruling which defined fluoridation as a 'preventative medication' noting that if fluoride is classified as a drug it must receive toxicological tests. He summarized that if no government agency in Canada regulates fluoridation chemicals and that if long term toxicological studies have not been conducted, then safety cannot be demonstrated and therefore the NSF Standard 60 is not satisfied. Dr. Parent stated that without the evidence of toxicology tests, the efficacy and safety of fluoride cannot be proven. He noted that 95 per cent of the world does not use water fluoridation and welcomed the Region of Peel to join in by reallocating an annual budget of \$500,000 for fluoridation to public health dental programs for prevention.

In response to a question raised by Councillor Kovac, Dr. Parent responded that natural fluoride does exist as a compound of calcium fluoride, however, fluoride is a problematic substance.

Councillor Innis asked if the Quebec government provides any dental services in schools or coverage for dentistry. Dr. Parent stated that the Quebec government provides free dental care for children up to age 6 and provides a topical fluoride rinse to students in schools.

Councillor Sprovieri requested clarification regarding why Health Canada classifies fluoride as a water treatment chemical as opposed to a drug, as was ruled by the Supreme Court. Dr. Parent responded that, in his opinion, if fluoride was classified as a drug then administering it without consent would contravene Article 7 of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, as well, it would need to be kept in hygienic premises and require toxicology testing to prove its effectiveness.

Councillor Innis arrived at 9:45 a.m.

A quorum of voting members was achieved.

1. ELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

RECOMMENDATION CWFC-1-2018

That Councillor Downey be appointed Chair of the Community Water Fluoridation Committee for a term ending on November 30, 2018, or upon dissolution of the Committee, whichever occurs first.

RECOMMENDATION CWFC-2-2018

That Councillor Sprovieri be appointed Vice-Chair of the Community Water Fluoridation Committee for a term ending on November 30, 2018, or upon dissolution of the Committee, whichever occurs first.

Councillor Sprovieri presided as Vice Chair.

2. DECLARATIONS OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST – Nil

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

RECOMMENDATION CWFC-3-2018:

That Delegations 4.1 and 4.2 listed on the agenda for the April 19, 2018 Community Water Fluoridation Committee meeting, be withdrawn;

And further, that the agenda for the April 19, 2018 Community Water Fluoridation Committee meeting be approved, as amended.

4. DELEGATIONS

4.1. Liesa Cianchino, Resident, Regarding Water Fluoridation in Peel

Withdrawn

4.2. Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel, Regarding Water Fluoridation in Peel

Withdrawn

4.3. Dr. Gilles Parent, Addressing the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care's Response to Regional Chair Dale's Letter Regarding Regional Water Fluoridation in Ontario

This item was dealt with earlier in the meeting

5. **REPORTS – Nil**

6. **COMMUNICATIONS**

6.1. **Tobiah Abramson, Order of Business Coordinator, Office of the City Clerk, The City of Windsor**, E-mail dated March 1, 2017, Responding to a Letter from Regional Chair Dale, Acknowledging Receipt of Resolution 2017-68

Received

6.2. **Heather Woolsey, Administrative Assistant, Administration and Legislation, City Clerk's Office, City of London**, E-mail dated March 7, 2017, Responding to a Letter from Regional Chair Dale, Acknowledging Receipt of Resolution 2017-68

Received

6.3. **Nancy J. Bozzato, Town Clerk, Pelham Niagara**, Letter dated March 8, 2017, Responding to a Letter from Regional Chair Dale, Acknowledging Receipt of Resolution 2017-68

Received

6.4. **Clerk's Office, Municipality of Dutton Dunwich**, Council Resolution dated March 8, 2017, Supporting the Region of Peel's Resolution 2017-68

Received

6.5. **Kathleen Wynne, Premier of Ontario**, Letter dated March 9, 2017, Responding to a Letter from Regional Chair Dale, Acknowledging Receipt of Resolution 2017-68 and Deferring Consideration to the Minister of Health and Long-Term Care

Received

6.6. **Dan Thibeault, Clerk Treasurer and Chief Administrative Officer, Municipality of Charlton and Dack**, Resolution dated March 13, 2017, Supporting the Region of Peel's Resolution 2017-68

Received

- 6.7. **Amber McDonald, Deputy Clerk, Township of Georgian Bay**, Letter dated March 14, 2017, Acknowledging Receipt of a Letter from Chair Dale, With Respect to Resolution 2017-68

Received

- 6.8. **Guylaine Coulombe, Chief Administrative Officer and Clerk, Municipality of Mattice Val Côté**, Resolution dated March 20, 2017, Supporting the Region of Peel's Resolution 2017-68

Received

- 6.9. **Agatha Armstrong, Deputy Clerk, Corporation of the Town of LaSalle**, Letter dated March 21, 2017, Providing a Copy of a Letter Sent to Kathleen Wynne, Premier of Ontario, Indicating Support of Region of Peel Resolution 2017-68

Received

- 6.10. **Alison Collard, Clerk, The Corporation of Champlain Township**, Letter dated March 21, 2017, Supporting the Region of Peel's Resolution 2017-68

Received

- 6.11. **Therese Hall, Administrative Assistant, Town of Englehart**, Letter dated March 22, 2017, Supporting the Region of Peel's Resolution 2017-185 Regarding Alternative Approaches to Water Fluoridation to the Current Community Water Fluoridation

Received

- 6.12. **Krista Royal, Deputy Clerk, Town of The Blue Mountains**, Resolution dated March 27, 2017, Acknowledging Receipt of a Letter from Chair Dale, With Respect to Resolution 2017-68

Received

- 6.13. **Liesa Cianchino, Resident**, E-mail dated March 29, 2017, Inquiring if the Region of Peel has Received a Response to Resolution 2017-68 from the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care

Received

- 6.14. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, E-mail dated March 31, 2017, Providing Information on the Biological Effects of Fluoride

Received

- 6.15. Liesa Cianchino, Resident**, E-mail dated March 31, 2017, Requesting a Copy of Regional Chair Dale's Letter to the Minister of Health and Long-Term Care and Responses Received from the Ministry

Received

- 6.16. Bonnie Nistico-Dunk, City Clerk, City of St. Catherines**, Letter dated March 31, 2017, Responding to a Letter from Regional Chair Dale, Acknowledging Receipt of Resolution 2017-68

Received

- 6.17. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, E-mail dated March 31, 2017, Providing Information and Studies Related to the Effects of Fluoride in Relation to Dementia/Alzheimer's

Received

- 6.18. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, E-mail dated March 31, 2017, Providing the 1957 Supreme Court Ruling that Fluoride is a Medication

Received

- 6.19. Dr. Lawrence Loh, Acting Medical Officer of Health, Region of Peel**, Email dated April 4, 2017, Responding to an Email from Councillor Tovey Regarding the Environmental Protection Agency's Response to the Challenges to Community Water Fluoridation Asserted by Paul Connett

Received

- 6.20. Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, E-mail dated April 4, 2017, Providing Information Regarding the Jurisdiction of the Ministry of Environment and Climate Change Over Large Municipal Drinking Water Systems

Received

- 6.21. Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, E-mail dated April 7, 2017, Responding to Information Contained in the Region of Peel Oral Health Report

Received

- 6.22. Robert Deschene, Chief Administrative Officer, Clerk, and Treasurer, Township of Nairn and Hyman**, Letter dated April 13, 2017, Responding to a Letter from Regional Chair Dale, Advocating to the Provincial Government to Clarify and Assume a Legislative Role in Community Water Fluoridation (Resolution 2017-185)

Received

- 6.23. Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, Email dated April 28, 2017, Providing Comments to Dr. Loh's Response to Ms. Massey's Formal Complaint

Received

- 6.24. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, Email dated April 28, 2017, Providing a List of Issues to be Considered by the Community Water Fluoridation Committee

Received

- 6.25. Victoria Bull, Deputy Clerk, The Corporation of the Township of Minden Hills**, Resolution dated May 25, 2017, Supporting the Region of Peel's Resolution 2017-68

Received

- 6.26. Jim Tovey, Regional Councillor, City of Mississauga**, Email dated July 4, 2017, Requesting the Inclusion of a Study Related to Water Fluoridation on the Community Water Fluoridation Committee Agenda

Received

- 6.27. Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, Email dated July 5, 2017, Responding to Kathryn Lockyer's E-mail dated July 5, 2017, Requesting Clarification on How and What Items will be Referred to the Community Water Fluoridation Committee

Received

- 6.28. **Olha Dobush, Director, Chronic Disease and Injury Prevention, Region of Peel**, Email dated July 17, 2017, Providing Councillor Sprovieri with Examples of Studies Demonstrating the Effectiveness and Safety of Community Water Fluoridation

Received

- 6.29. **Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, Email dated August 8, 2017, Providing Information from the Fluoride Action Network Regarding Australia's Fluoridation Review

Received

- 6.30. **Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, Email dated August 21, 2017, Providing a Report Regarding Fluoride and Cataract Blindness

Received

- 6.31. **Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, Email dated September 12, 2017, Providing Information from a Former Chief Dental Officer at the US Public Health Service

Received

- 6.32. **Merilyn Haines, Chair, Fluoride Action Network, Australia**, Email dated September 13, 2017, Regarding Flawed Review of Water Fluoridation from the 2017 National Health and Medical Research Council

Received

- 6.33. **Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, Email dated September 22, 2017, Providing Information on Studies Regarding Fluoride Exposure in Utero Linked to Lower IQ in Kids

Received

- 6.34. **Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, Email dated October 11, 2017, Providing a News Release Regarding Tooth Decay Rates in Calgary

Received

- 6.35. Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, Email dated January 26, 2018, Regarding the Region of Peel Budget Related to Hydrofluorisilicic Acid in Drinking Water

Received

- 6.36. Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, E-mail dated February 22, 2018, Providing an Update Regarding Fluoride Effects on Pineal Glands

Received

- 6.37. Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, Email dated February 8, 2018, Regarding Article in "Nature", an Academic Journal, Regarding "Impact of Drinking Water Fluoride on Human Thyroid Hormones: A Case-Control Study"

Received

- 6.38. Gurpreet Singh Dhillon, City Councillor, City of Brampton**, Providing Comments Regarding Water Fluoridation as Referred from the November 16, 2017 Regional Council Budget Meeting

Received

- 6.39. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, Email dated February 27, 2018, Regarding the Minister of Health and Long-Term Care's Resignation

Received

- 6.40. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, E-mail dated March 2, 2018, Regarding a Blog Posted by Siskinds Environmental Law Related to the *Safe Water Drinking Act* and the Standard of Care

Received

- 6.41. John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton, E-mail dated March 10, 2018**, Responding to an E-mail from Christine Massey, Regarding the Medical Officer of Health Declining Fluoridation Debate in Parry Sound

Received

- 6.42. **Dr. Raymond Ray, Retired Biochemist and Nuclear Physicist**, E-mail dated March 12, 2018 Regarding Concerns Associated with Water Fluoridation

Received

- 6.43. **Roselle Martino, Assistant Deputy Minister, Population and Public Health Division, Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care**, Letter dated March 23, 2018, Providing a Response to Regional Chair Dale's Letter Regarding Regional Water Fluoridation in Ontario (Resolution 2017-68)

Received

- 6.44. **Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, E-mail dated April 2, 2018, Regarding Fluoride Intake for Children

Received

- 6.45. **Christine Massey, Spokesperson, Fluoride Free Peel**, E-mail dated April 4, 2018, Regarding Fluoride Exposure in Utero

Received

- 6.46. **Karen Ras, Regional Councillor, City of Mississauga**, E-mail dated April 5, 2018, Providing Her Resignation from the Community Water Fluoridation Committee

Received

- 6.47. **John Sprovieri, Regional Councillor, City of Brampton**, E-mail dated April 6, 2018, Submitting a Hyperlink to a Video from Simon Fraser University Regarding the Impact of Toxins on the Developing Brain

Received

- 6.48. **Annette Groves, Regional Councillor, Town of Caledon**, E-mail dated April 10, 2018, Providing Her Resignation from the Community Water Fluoridation Committee

Received

7. **IN CAMERA MATTERS - Nil**

8. OTHER BUSINESS

8.1 Recommendation from Councillor Palleschi Regarding Verification of Water Fluoridation Statements

RECOMMENDATION CWFC-4-2018:

That staff report to the next Community Water Fluoridation Committee meeting to verify the following listed statements:

1. The Supreme Court of Canada ruled that water fluoridation is a medication.
2. Health Canada classifies water fluoridation as a water treatment chemical.
3. The Supreme Court Ruling that water fluoridation is a medication is still in effect.
4. The Minister of Health and Long Term Care states that tooth decay is a disease.
5. The Minister of Health and Long Term Care states that water fluoridation prevents tooth decay.
6. Section 7 of the Charter of Rights and Freedoms protect Canadians from forced medication.
7. The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) states that fluoride is mainly effective in reducing cavities when applied topically.
8. Dr. Cooney admitted that water fluoridation prevents less than a ½ cavity per person per lifetime.
9. The World Health Organization (WHO) reports that cavity rates in un-fluoridated countries are similar to fluoridated countries.
10. Health Canada and the Provincial Minister of Health promote water fluoridation to be safe and effective.
11. Seventy per cent of Canadian towns and cities have discontinued water fluoridation.
12. Fluoride, classified as a Neuro Toxin by the US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), is similar in toxicity to lead and arsenic.
13. Health Canada has the authority to legislate water fluoridation to all Canadians.
14. The Province of Ontario has the authority to legislate water fluoridation for all Ontarians.
15. Toxicology reviews are recommended by Health Canada to ensure the safety of fluoridation products.
16. Toxicology studies are required on fluoridation products to obtain National Sanitation Foundation (NSF) Standard 60 certification.
17. Health Canada required toxicology reviews on hydroflourosilicic acid (HFSA) have not been done.
18. The U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA) has never approved fluoride supplements as safe and effective in preventing tooth decay.
19. Harmful chemicals that make up fluoridation products such as HFSA accumulate in our bodies.
20. No one has the authority to force medication on people without their consent.

And further, that given that 70 per cent of Canadian towns and cities have discontinued water Fluoridation in the past 70 years, and given that both Health Canada and the Province claim that water fluoridation is important for good health:

1. Why has the Province or Health Canada not legislated Water Fluoridation for all Canadians?
2. Why has the responsibility to approve water fluoridation been placed on Municipal Councillors when 70 per cent of Canadians have rejected the practice?
3. Why do Malton's children have much higher cavity rates than the rest of the Region's children?
4. Why did the Provincial Government fail to approve MPP Delaney's Private Member's Bill to legislate water fluoridation in Ontario?
5. Who is responsible to conduct the Health Canada Toxicology reviews on HFSA to ensure it is safe for human consumption?

Councillor Palleschi requested that staff speak with the Chair of the CWFC to determine when the report can be prepared prior to setting a date for the next CWFC meeting.

9. NEXT MEETING

To be determined

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 10:20 a.m.